

---

## CIRCULAR

Please pass on sufficient copies of this Circular to your Treasurer/Director of Finance and to your Personnel and Pensions Officer(s) as quickly as possible

---

**No. 125 - NOVEMBER 2002**

### **PART-TIMERS PENSION RIGHTS**

#### **Purpose of the Circular**

1. This Circular has been issued to provide authorities with information in connection with the recent letter issued by the Regional Secretary to the Employment Tribunals.

#### **Background**

2. Amongst the issues that remain outstanding following the initial part timer test case hearings is the question of whether, in order to succeed, a female applicant claiming sex discrimination must identify a male comparator i.e. a full-time male employee also employed by her employer whose work was the same as, or broadly similar to, or of equal value with, her work. This question has been referred to the European Court of Justice in a case called *Allonby -v- Accrington and Rossendale College and others* and any case in which an employer asserts that no comparator exists must remain stayed until the outcome of the appeal process in the *Allonby* case.
3. Although in notices of appearance for the test cases the point had been made that a number of the part-time applicants had not named a comparator, many of the public sector employers no longer wished to pursue that point at the test case hearings because they recognised that a comparator existed and could therefore be named.



Tel 020 7296 6745 fax 0207296 6739 [www.lg-employers.gov.uk/pensions/index.html](http://www.lg-employers.gov.uk/pensions/index.html)  
Email [tery.Edwards@lg-employers.gov.uk](mailto:tery.Edwards@lg-employers.gov.uk)

Executive Director: Charles Nolda

Registered in England No 2676611 Registered office: Local Government House, Smith Square, London SW1P  
3HZ

## **Letter from the Regional Secretary to the Employment Tribunals**

4. The Regional Secretary to the Employment Tribunals has recently written to all employers in the part-time worker pension cases to clarify whether or not they wish to contend that no comparator exists within their workforce for all or any of the cases in which they are named as a respondent.
5. The letter asks employers to indicate their position by ticking one of three boxes on the sheet attached to the letter and returning that sheet to the address shown on the Employment Tribunal letter, preferably within 42 days.
6. For employers with many part-timer claims lodged against them it is possible that they will need to tick box 2 in respect of some employees and box 3 in respect of other employees in which case a schedule should be attached showing which employees box 2 applies to and which employees box 3 applies to.
7. The letter also requests that employers ticking box 3 in respect of any applicant or group of applicants should briefly indicate why they say no comparator exists. This reply will then be copied to the applicant and unless the applicant is at that stage able to name a comparator the case will be stayed pending the outcome of the appeal in the *Allonby* case.

### **Actions for employing authorities to take**

8. The LGPC Secretariat understands that the Secretary of State, as one of the respondents, does not intend to raise the defence of 'no comparator'.
9. However, as a separate respondent, those employing authorities who receive the aforementioned letter from the Regional Secretary to the Employment Tribunals will need to decide whether or not they wish to contend, as a defence, that no comparator exists for one or more of their part-time applicants.
10. In making this decision, authorities may wish to weigh up the financial and other merits of making such a defence relative to the numbers of such cases, the initial work involved in assessing whether or not (in the authority's view) a comparator exists, the chances of success in using this defence, and the time and effort involved in defending the case.

11. Authorities may wish to consult their legal sections before responding to the letter from the Regional Secretary to the Employment Tribunals.

### **Actions for administering authorities to take**

12. Administering authorities should consider copying this Circular to all employers in their Fund that may be affected by the above (other than to local authorities in England and Wales to whom this Circular has been sent direct).

Terry Edwards  
LGPC Pensions Consultant  
12 November 2002

### **Distribution**

Chief Executives of Local Authorities in England and Wales (3 copies)  
Pension Managers of Administering Authorities  
Pension Managers (outsourced) and Administering Authority Client Managers  
Officer Advisory Group  
Local Government Pensions Committee  
Trade Unions  
ODPM  
COSLA  
SPPA  
Private Clients

### **Website**

Visit the LGPC website at:  
<http://www.lg-employers.gov.uk/pensions/index.html>

### **Copyright**

Employers' Organisation for Local Government (the EO). This Circular may be reproduced without the prior permission of the EO provided it is not used for commercial gain, the source is acknowledged and, if regulations are reproduced, the Crown Copyright Policy Guidance issued by HMSO is adhered to.

### **Disclaimer**

The information contained in this Circular has been prepared by the LGPC Secretariat, a part of the Employers' Organisation. It represents the views of the Secretariat and should not be treated as a complete and authoritative statement of the law. Readers may wish, or will need, to take their own legal advice on the interpretation of any particular piece of legislation. No responsibility whatsoever will be assumed by the Employers' Organisation for any direct or consequential loss, financial or otherwise, damage or inconvenience, or any

other obligation or liability incurred by readers relying on information contained in this Circular. Whilst every attempt is made to ensure the accuracy of the Circular, it would be helpful if readers could bring to the attention of the Secretariat any perceived errors or omissions. Please write to:

LGPC

Employers' Organisation for Local Government,  
Layden House  
76 - 86 Turnmill Street  
London, EC1M 5LG

or e-mail [terry.edwards@lg-employers.gov.uk](mailto:terry.edwards@lg-employers.gov.uk)